

PHILOSOPHIA CHRISTI

EDITOR'S INTRODUCTION	CRAIG J. HAZEN	3
SYMPOSIUM ON MATERIALISM		
Guest Editor's Introduction	JEREMY EVANS	7
A New Argument against Materialism	ALVIN PLANTINGA	9
Plantinga's New Argument against Materialism	MICHAEL TOOLEY	29
Functionalism and Materialism: A Reply to Tooley	ALVIN PLANTINGA	49
ARTICLES		
Michael Polanyi and Alvin Plantinga: Help from Beyond the Walls	ESTHER L. MEEK	57
Are Created Spirits Composed of Matter and Form? A Defense of Pneumatic Hylomorphism	NATHAN A. JACOBS	79
Change of Heart: Forgiveness, Resentment, and Empathy	CRISTIAN MIHUT	109
The Challenge to Virtue, Character, and Forgiveness from Psychology and Philosophy	CHRISTIAN MILLER	125
Buddha, the Apostle Paul, and John Hick: The Challenge of Inter-Religious Epistemologies	JOHN JEFFERSON DAVIS	145
The Existence and Irrelevance of Gratuitous Evil	KIRK R. MACGREGOR	165
PHILOSOPHICAL NOTES		
Is N. T. Wright Right about Substance Dualism?	STEWART GOETZ	183
Experimental Thoughts and Thought Experiments: Reflections on What Matters in Recent Work by Derek Parfit	CHARLES TALIAFERRO	193
Zygotes, Embryos, and Subsistence: A Response to Corcoran	FRANCIS J. BECKWITH	209
BOOK REVIEWS		
Penelope Maddy, <i>Defending the Axioms: On the Philosophical Foundations of Set Theory</i>	WILLIAM LANE CRAIG	223
Philip Tallon, <i>The Poetics of Evil: Toward an Aesthetic Theodicy</i>	CHARLES TALIAFERRO	228

K. Scott Oliphint, <i>God with Us: Divine Condescension and the Attributes of God</i>	NATHAN D. SHANNON	232
John Howard Yoder, <i>The War of the Lamb: The Ethics of Nonviolence and Peacemaking</i> , and Stanley Hauerwas, <i>War and the American Difference: Theological Reflections on Violence and National Identity</i>	DAVID CRAMER	237
Clifford Williams, <i>Existential Reasons for Belief in God: A Defense of Desires and Emotions for Faith</i>	RAYMOND J. VANARRAGON	241
NEWS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS		246

Editor's Introduction

The entire team at *Philosophia Christi* wishes you a restful summer—but not too restful. We hope to get your blood flowing again midsummer with the stimulating set of eclectic essays contained herein. May this new issue of the journal leap from your mailbox and cause you tremendous mental unrest of the most creative kind!

I won't give much by way of introduction to volume 14, number 1, because Jeremy Evans, guest editor of the lead feature, a symposium on materialism, does such a bang-up job in his introduction. Introductions don't normally get much positive attention, but I was really pleased how thorough his opening remarks were. He does a marvelous job summarizing the Plantinga–Tooley exchange and prepares the reader to read it at full throttle. Nice work, Jeremy!

My space is better spent pointing out the next big research opportunity through the Evangelical Philosophical Society. If you have not yet heard, we are sponsoring a major research and publication effort in the area of ramified natural theology. We have enlisted Angus Menuge and Charles Taliaferro as guest editors and have put out a call for papers. Completed papers will be due by March 31, 2013. In order to explore how you might participate, simply go to the following web page for all the information:

<http://bit.ly/RamifiedNaturalTheology>

If the new issue of *Philosophia Christi* does not get you twisting in your beach chair, this call for papers certainly will!

One last thing: don't forget to mark your calendars and register for our annual meeting in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, November 14–17. Another cutting-edge program is shaping up. Hope to see you there.

Craig J. Hazen
Biola University

Symposium on
Materialism

Guest Editor's Introduction

Materialism is the rage these days, so much so that some Christian thinkers are shifting away from long-standing traditions on the relationship of the mind and body (dualism of some sort) to provide a more scientific vision of mind-body interaction and personal identity. In order to move this discussion forward *Philosophia Christi* invited Alvin Plantinga to advance some of his arguments made in his famous essay “An Evolutionary Argument against Naturalism,” drawing to the front some of the problems that materialism must address. In this entry, Plantinga focuses on some problems inherent to materialism pertaining to theories of belief formation, intentionality, and the undertakings of agents. In essence, Plantinga argues that if materialism is true (whether it be of a reductive or nonreductive type) then the usual connection between beliefs and intentions do not provide the causal story that is needed to account for a person’s undertaking some endeavor. If neither beliefs nor intentions are causally relevant to an agent’s undertakings, then, as Plantinga argues, this provides a strong argument against materialism. We invite the reader to inspect Plantinga’s entry in order to piece together the argument.

We also invited Michael Tooley to provide a materialist response to Plantinga. Tooley seemed especially suited for this discussion given his previous exchange with Plantinga in their excellent book, *The Knowledge of God* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2008). In this entry, Tooley seeks to overcome what, he thinks, are misrepresentations of materialism by Plantinga—personal identity does not track bodily identity, or brain identity, or upper brain identity, so I am not identical with my body, or with my brain, or with my upper brain. After developing some necessary groundwork, Tooley argues that Plantinga’s new argument against materialism is unsound because it “fails to distinguish, first of all, between mere physical movement on the one hand, and genuine, intentional action on the other, and secondly, between the causation of mere physical movement on the one hand, and the explanation of genuine intentional action on the other.” Subsequent to this argument Tooley then advances what is, in his opinion, the strongest form of materialism and why Plantinga’s argument does not address it. In his second article, Plantinga offers a response to this critique.

The team at *Philosophia Christi* offers our deepest thanks to both Dr. Plantinga and Dr. Tooley for their work found within these pages. The reading is both philosophically interesting and a model of collegiality.

Jeremy Evans
Wake Forest University